January 15, 2013

Dannel P. Malloy
Governor
State of Connecticut
210 Capital Avenue
Hartford, Connecticut 06106

RE: Issuance of Second-Tier Driver’s Licenses Without Proof of Legal Residence Under REAL ID Act

Dear Governor Malloy:

We write as law professors whose teaching and scholarship focus on immigration law. This letter offers our legal opinion on a current proposal to expand access to driver’s licenses to residents of the state of Connecticut without proof of legal residence, and specifically on whether such a proposal falls afoul of the federal REAL ID Act. We offer no views on the policy dimensions of the proposal being considered in your state. We write, instead, only to explain that nothing in the federal REAL ID Act bars any state, whether it has come into compliance with the law or not, from issuing second-tier licenses to undocumented immigrants.¹ According to the plain text of the statute and the statements of federal officials tasked with implementing it, such a program is clearly permissible.

When Congress passed the REAL ID Act in 2005, it created minimum standards for a new category of compliant state driver’s licenses and identification cards. After the effective date, which has just recently been, once again, indefinitely postponed,² “a Federal agency may not accept, for any official purpose, a driver’s license or identification card issued by a State to any person unless the State is meeting the requirements of [the Act].”³ In addition to barring undocumented immigrants from this new category of state driver’s licenses that are valid for federal identification purposes, the REAL ID Act’s requirements exclude some other categories of immigrants, including persons granted withholding of removal, persons paroled into the

¹ We do not address in this letter the issue of whether individuals who are approved for deferred action under the federal government’s Deferred Action for Childhood Arrivals (DACA) program should receive driver’s licenses. It is clear that those young people are included in the definition of persons with lawful status under the REAL ID Act and therefore should receive a state driver’s license that can be used for federal purposes. See Real ID Act of 2005, Pub. L. No. 109-13, 119 Stat. 231, 315, § 202 (c)(2)(B)(viii); 6 C.F.R. § 37.3 (definition of lawful status under the Act). This letter instead addresses the question of whether Connecticut can issue second-tier licenses (i.e., not to be used for federal purposes) to undocumented immigrants who are unable to demonstrate lawful status under the Act.


United States, and persons with pending applications for nonimmigrant visas (for example, victims of trafficking).4

Many drivers will be unable to obtain licenses valid for federal identification purposes under this law, but the statutory text of REAL ID and the implementing regulation and rules explicitly recognize a state’s ability to offer two tiers of driver’s licenses, where one type of license is valid for federal purposes and the other is not. The statute recognizes the possibility for a two-tier system and allows the issuance of a noncompliant license, which “(A) clearly states on its face that it may not be accepted by any Federal agency for Federal identification or any other official purpose; and (B) uses a unique design or color indicator to alert Federal agency and other law enforcement personnel that it may not be accepted for any such purpose.”5

The implementing regulation incorporates this language as well, requiring that “[s]tates that DHS determines are compliant with the REAL ID Act that choose to also issue driver's licenses and identification cards that are not acceptable by Federal agencies for official purposes must ensure that such driver's licenses and identification cards” meet the requirements of § 202(d)(11).6

Exercising the authority indisputably conferred by federal statute and regulation, Connecticut already offers two tiers of licenses. As of October 3, 2011, Connecticut offers the “Select ID,” which is valid for federal identification purposes under REAL ID.7 Connecticut has also chosen to continue to offer noncompliant licenses as well, but only to those seeking to renew their licenses, not to new applicants.8

So long as noncompliant licenses are appropriately marked, states are free under federal law to require as much or as little documentation as they wish from applicants for these licenses. Three states – New Mexico, Utah, and Washington – make driver’s licenses or something similar available to undocumented immigrants.9 The Illinois Senate passed a measure to expand access to driver’s licenses for undocumented residents in December, and legislation is pending in the Illinois House.10

---

4 Joan Friedland, Final REAL ID Regulations Fail to Ease New Burdens on Immigrants, NAT’L IMMIGRATION LAW CTR. (Feb. 27, 2008), http://www.nilc.org/immspbs/DLs/DL039.htm. Further, some lawful immigrants may have difficulty obtaining these federally valid licenses because their status must be verified by the Systematic Alien Verification for Entitlements (SAVE) system, a Department of Homeland Security (DHS) database with documented deficiencies. Id.


While these states are not yet fully compliant with the REAL ID Act, this is not because they offer licenses to undocumented residents, but rather because they do not also offer licenses that meet the statutory requirements for federally valid identification. Utah already utilizes a two-tier system; if and when REAL ID is implemented, Washington and New Mexico may also implement a two-tier system so that their first-tier driver’s licenses are accepted as federal identification.

Official statements by the federal official responsible for implementing the REAL ID Act reiterate explicitly that the two-tier option allows states to issue noncompliant licenses to undocumented immigrants. DHS Secretary Michael Chertoff spoke directly to the issue in 2007: “To the extent that a state issues a class of license that is not based on lawful presence in the United States, those licenses will not comply with REAL ID … requirements,” he explained, “[b]ut federal law does allow states to make that choice . . . . Congress has spoken to the issue; the option is open to the states.”¹¹

Connecticut would clearly be acting in compliance with the REAL ID Act and other federal law if it were to allow residents without proof of immigration status to obtain second-tier driver’s licenses. Connecticut could still accept these licenses for state identification purposes, although they would not be valid for federal purposes. In this letter, we do not advocate the wisdom of such a legislative policy. Our purpose in writing is more limited and straightforward: to explain that federal law in general, and the REAL ID Act in particular, presents no obstacle to the passage and implementation of this policy; in fact, the statute and DHS policy explicitly permit states to offer second-tier driver’s licenses to all their residents, irrespective of immigration status.

Respectfully yours,

David Abraham  
Professor of Law  
University of Miami School of Law

Deborah Anker  
Clinical Professor of Law  
Director, Harvard Immigration & Refugee Clinical Program  
Harvard Law School

Muneer Ahmad  
Clinical Professor of Law  
Yale Law School

Jon Bauer  
Clinical Professor of Law &  
Director, Asylum and Human Rights Clinic  
University of Connecticut School of Law

Raquel Aldana  
Professor of Law  
Pacific McGeorge School of Law

Linda Bosniak  
Distinguished Professor of Law  
Rutgers Law School-Camden

Richard Boswell  
Professor of Law  
University of California, Hastings College of Law

Eduardo Capulong  
Associate Professor of Law  
Director, Mediation Clinic  
University of Montana School of Law

Jennifer M. Chacón  
Professor of Law  
University of California Irvine School of Law

Gabriel J. Chin  
Professor of Law  
University of California, Davis, School of Law

Adam B. Cox  
Professor of Law  
New York University School of Law

Keith Cunningham-Parmer  
Associate Professor of Law  
Willamette University College of Law

Alina Das  
Assistant Professor of Clinical Law  
New York University School of Law

Ingrid Eagly  
UCLA School of Law  
Assistant Professor of Law

Stella Burch Elias  
Associate Professor of Law  
University of Iowa College of Law

César Cuauhtémoc García Hernández  
Assistant Professor  
Capital University Law School

Jennifer Gordon  
Professor of Law  
Fordham University School of Law

Anjum Gupta  
Assistant Professor of Law  
Director, Immigrant Rights Clinic  
Rutgers School of Law – Newark

Jonathan Hafetz  
Associate Professor of Law  
Seton Hall University School of Law

Bill Ong Hing  
Professor of Law  
University of San Francisco

Geoffrey A. Hoffman  
Clinical Associate Professor  
University of Houston Law Center

Kevin Johnson  
Dean & Mabie-Apallas Professor of Public Interest Law and Chicana/o Studies  
University of California Davis School of Law

Anil Kalhan  
Associate Professor of Law  
Drexel University Earle Mack School of Law

Jennifer Lee Koh  
Assistant Professor of Law & Director, Immigration Clinic  
Western State University College of Law

Christopher N. Lasch  
Assistant Professor  
University of Denver Sturm College of Law

Stephen Lee  
Assistant Professor of Law  
University of California Irvine School of Law
Issuance of Second-Tier Driver’s Licenses Without Proof of Legal Residence Under REAL ID

María Pabón López
Dean & Judge Adrian G. Duplantier
Distinguished Professor of Law
Loyola University New Orleans College of Law

Beth Lyon
Professor of Law
Director, Farmworker Legal Aid Clinic & Co-Director, Community Interpreter Internship
Villanova University School of Law

Lynn Marcus
Co-Director, Immigration Clinic
University of Arizona James E. Rogers College of Law

Peter L. Markowitz
Clinical Associate Professor of Law
Cardozo School of Law

M. Isabel Medina
Ferris Family Distinguished Professor of Law
Loyola University New Orleans College of Law

Nancy Morawetz
Professor of Clinical Law
New York University School of Law

Hiroshi Motomura
Professor of Law
UCLA School of Law

Michael A. Olivas
Bates Distinguished Chair in Law
University of Houston Law Center

Huyen Pham
Associate Dean for Faculty Research & Development
Professor of Law
Texas Wesleyan School of Law

Susan Westerberg Prager
Professor of Law
UCLA School of Law

Nina Rabin
Senior Liman Fellow in Residence
Yale Law School
Associate Clinical Professor of Law
University of Arizona James E. Rogers College of Law (on leave 2012-2013)

Jaya Ramji-Nogales
Associate Professor of Law
Temple University, Beasley School of Law
Victor C. Romero
Maureen B. Cavanaugh Distinguished Faculty Scholar & Professor of Law
The Pennsylvania State University, Dickinson School of Law

Rachel E. Rosenbloom
Associate Professor of Law
Northeastern University School of Law

Philip G. Schrag
Delaney Family Professor of Public Interest Law
Georgetown University

Rebecca Sharpless
Associate Clinical Professor
University of Miami School of Law

Jayashri Srikantiah
Professor of Law & Director, Immigrants’ Rights Clinic
Stanford Law School

Juliet P Stumpf
Professor of Law
Lewis & Clark Law School

Leti Volpp
Professor
University of California, Berkeley School of Law
Issuance of Second-Tier Driver’s Licenses Without Proof of Legal Residence Under REAL ID

Shoba Sivaprasad Wadhia                                      Michael J. Wishnie
Clinical Professor &                                          William O. Douglas Clinical Professor of
Director, Center for Immigrants’ Rights                       Law
Pennsylvania State University                                  Yale Law School
   Dickinson School of Law                                     
Jonathan Weinberg                                             Stephen Yale-Loehr
Professor of Law                                               Adjunct Professor
Wayne State University                                         Cornell Law School

Deborah M. Weissman                                           
Reef C. Ivey II Distinguished Professor of
Law                                                           
University of North Carolina School of Law

* Institutional affiliations of all signatories listed for identification only.

cc:  Melody A. Currey, Commissioner, Department of Motor Vehicles
     Senator Donald E. Williams, Jr., President Pro Tempore
     Senator Martin M. Looney, Majority Leader
     Senator John McKinney, Minority Leader
     Senator Leonard Fasano, Minority Leader Pro Tempore
     Representative Brendan Sharkey, Speaker of the House
     Representative Joe Aresimowicz, Majority Leader
     Representative Lawrence F. Cafero, Jr., Minority Leader
     Senator Andrew M. Maynard, Co-Chair, Transportation Committee
     Representative Antonio Guerrera, Co-Chair, Transportation Committee
     Senator Joseph J. Crisco, Jr., Co-Chair, Insurance and Real Estate Committee
     Representative Robert W. Megna, Co-Chair, Insurance and Real Estate Committee
     Senator Eric D. Coleman, Co-Chair, Judiciary Committee
     Representative Gerald M. Fox, Co-Chair, Judiciary Committee